

City Council

Monday 19 September 2016

PRESENT:

Councillor Murphy, in the Chair.

Councillor Sam Davey, Vice Chair.

Councillors Mrs Aspinall, Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowie, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Mrs Bridgeman, Carson, Churchill, Coker, Cook, Dann, Darcy, Philippa Davey, Deacon, Downie, Drear, Evans, Fletcher, K Foster, Mrs Foster, Fry, Hendy, Jordan, Kelly, Martin Leaves, Michael Leaves, Sam Leaves, Dr Mahony, Mavin, McDonald, Morris, Nicholson, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Mrs Pengelly, Rennie, Ricketts, Riley, Singh, Sparling, Stevens, Storer, Jon Taylor, Kate Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler, Wiggins and Winter.

Apologies for absence: Councillors James, Loveridge, Lowry, Penberthy and Smith

The meeting started at 2.00 pm and finished at 9.15 pm.

Note: The full discussion can be viewed on the webcast of the City Council meeting at www.plymouth.gov.uk. At a future meeting, the Council will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.

29. Minutes

The minutes of the meeting held on 27 June 2016 and 11 July 2016 were agreed.

30. Declarations of interest

The following declarations of interest were made by councillors in accordance with the code of conduct in respect of items under consideration at the meeting -

Name	Minute Number	Reason	Interest
Councillor Sparling	37c Proposals for GP Services in Plymouth	Attends GP surgery mentioned in the motion.	Private
Councillor Coker	37c Proposals for GP Services in Plymouth	Attends a GP surgery mentioned in the motion.	Private
Councillor Sam Leaves	37c Proposals for GP Services in Plymouth	Employed by CCG	Private
Councillor Jon Taylor	37c Proposals for GP Services in Plymouth	Employed by CCG	Private
Councillor Cook	37h Sprinklers in Schools	Employed by Eaton Electric who supply fire systems.	Disclosable Pecuniary Interest

31. **Appointments to committees and outside bodies**

The following changes reported to the Assistant Director and Head of Legal Services were noted –

	Working Group	Membership
(a)	Plymouth Plan Working Group	Councillor Stevens to replace Councillor Coker

	Outside Body	Membership
(b)	SACRE (Conservative vacancy)	Councillor Ball

32. **Announcements**

The Lord Mayor welcomed members of staff to the Council and presented certificates and trophies to individuals and teams who had been successful in achieving the following:

- (a) Margaret Bersey – awarded MBE in the Queen’s Birthday Honours list and recently retired from Plymouth City Council after 40 years working with children and young people.
- (b) The following people were presented with an award at the recent Star Awards Ceremony:
 - Apprentice of the Year Award: Katherine Bell, Tennis Development Apprentice;
 - Children and Young Person’s Social Worker of the Year Award: Alice Royle;
 - Colleague of the Year Award: Mary O’Gorman, Adoption Recruitment and Support Worker;
 - Commercial Enterprise Award: James Watt, Head of Land and Property;
 - Customer Service Award: Sharon Day, Lawyer and Sue Rouse, Project Manager;
 - Leadership Award: Anna Coles, Programme Manager;
 - Living Our Values Award: Hannah Sloggett, Neighbourhood Planning Manager;
 - Local Hero Award: Pete Crocker, Street Services Supervisor;
 - Our Partners Star Award: the Complex Needs System Optimisation Group;
 - Plymouth City Council’s Got Talent Award: Lenny Harley, Customer Adviser;
 - Promoting Plymouth Award: Central Library Team;
 - School Staff Star Award: Helga Pinn, Mill Ford School;
 - Individual Star Award: Helen Fox, Personal Adviser;
 - Team Star Award: Bereavement Service;
 - Two Special Recognition Awards for Margaret Bersey MBE and the Housing Delivery Team;
 - Two Leader’s Awards to the History Centre Team and the Electoral Services Team.

- (c) The Low Carbon City Team won 2 prestigious National Community Energy Awards. Plymouth City Council was crowned Local Authority Partner of the Year and Community Energy Champion 2016.
- (d) Plymouth Art Weekender which runs from 23 to 26 September. This three-day event will celebrate the city's visual arts sector.

Announcements from the Leader:

- (a) Mayflower 2020 Project;
- (b) Devolution Proposals;
- (c) Recent meeting with the Marine Sector.

33. **Questions by the public**

There were no questions from members of the public.

34. **Capital and Revenue Monitoring Report 2016/17 - Quarter 1**

Councillor Darcy (Cabinet Member for Finance/ICT) presented the report on the Capital and Revenue Monitoring Report 2016/17. Following a vote, Council agreed to increase the Capital Budget 2016 – 2021 to £447m.

35. **Adoption of new byelaws regulating activities of Acupuncture, Electrolysis, Tattooing, Cosmetic Piercing and Semi Permanent Skin Colouring**

Councillor Riley (Cabinet Member for HR/Democracy and Governance/Licensing) presented his report on the adoption of new byelaws regulating activities of Acupuncture, Electrolysis, Tattooing, Cosmetic Piercing and Skin Colouring for noting. Council agreed to:

1. Adopt the new byelaws to set minimum standards of cleanliness and hygiene in the carrying out of Acupuncture, tattooing, semi-permanent skin-colouring, cosmetic piercing and electrolysis as set out in Appendix I of the report.
2. Authorise officers to carry out the necessary procedure in relation to the creation of the new byelaw (which includes application to the Secretary of State for confirmation of the byelaw and publishing a notice in the local newspaper of the intention to do so).
3. Authorise the Common Seal of the Council to be applied to the new byelaw.
4. Revoke the existing byelaws upon the coming into force of the new byelaw.

36. **Corporate Plan 2016-19**

Councillor Bowyer (Leader) proposed and Councillor Nicholson (Deputy Leader) seconded the recommendation to adopt the Corporate Plan 2016-2019. Following a vote Council agreed the Corporate Plan 2016 –19.

37. MOTIONS ON NOTICE

With the agreement of Council, the Lord Mayor announced that, in order to assist people in the public gallery and those watching on the webcast and to aid the efficient running of the meeting, that the first motion to be debated would be 10h, 'Safety of Fisherman followed by 10i, 'Development of fishing in Plymouth'. This would be immediately followed by 10a, 'Proposals for GP Services in Plymouth' then 10g, NHS England Proposals. After these motions had been considered, Motions on Notice 10c and 10e on Stonehouse Barracks would be debated consecutively. Then the meeting would return to the other Motions on Notice, starting with 10b 'Organ Donation Awareness', and be debated in the order on the agenda.

- (i) Safety of fishermen
Councillor Evans proposed and Councillor Mavin seconded the motion on the Safety of Fishermen.

Councillor Mrs Bridgeman proposed and Councillor Storer seconded an amendment, which was circulated to Members, as follows:

'The fishing industry is a key component of the life of the City of Plymouth and the safety of our 700 Plymouth fishermen and their 360 vessels is paramount.

This Council supports the national campaign 'Sea You Home Safe' supported by the Maritime & Coastguard Agency, the RNLI and the Fishermen's Mission, to ensure that every commercial fisherman in the UK is provided with a Personal Floatation Device.

The work of the National Federation of Fishermen's Organisations, Seafish, the Fishermen's Mission and the RNLI to distribute 1350 personal floatation devices to fishermen in England and Wales is welcomed.

Plymouth City Council resolves to support Seafish in their application to the Marine Management Organisation for funding through the European Maritime and Fisheries Fund to fully fund to purchase of a further 5,000 Personal Floatation Devices equipped with Personal Locator Beacons for distribution to the remaining fishermen in England.

This will ensure that those local fishermen who would struggle financially to buy one of these potentially lifesaving pieces of equipment can be provided at no cost.'

The meeting was adjourned at 3.15 pm for 10 minutes to enable Members to consider the amendment.

A debate took place on the legality of the amendment. The Monitoring Officer advised that the amendment did not negate the original motion; it included additional context and advised that the amendment was, therefore, lawful.

The Lord Mayor requested a meeting with the Leader, Shadow Leader and

Group Whips in private to discuss this matter further. The meeting was adjourned at 3.50 pm.

The Monitoring Officer reported that, following discussions between the group leaders during the adjournment, the proposed amendment would be withdrawn and substituted with the following amendment:

'For Plymouth City Council to make an application to the Marine Management Organisation for funding through the European Maritime and Fisheries Fund to fully fund the purchase of Personal Floatation Devices (PFD's) equipped with Personal Locator Beacons (PLB's) and to develop a delivery scheme in partnership with the local fishing industry. This would ensure that those local fishermen who would struggle financially to buy one of these potentially lifesaving pieces of equipment can be provided at no cost. The Chief Executive to write to the LGA to request they encourage all other Councils to follow suit and support the fishing industry nationally.'

Following a vote, the amendment was agreed.

Following a vote, the amended motion was agreed.

- (ii) Development of fishing
Councillor Evans proposed and Councillor Dann seconded a motion on the Development of Fishing in Plymouth.

Following a vote, the motion was carried and Council agreed to:

Apply to the Marine Management Organisation for funding through the European Maritime and Fisheries Fund to facilitate:

1. Feasibility studies and provision of professional services to develop marketing strategies for marketing of Britain's Ocean City fish as set out in Article 27.
2. To develop and fund working partnerships between PCC, Fishermen and local scientific institutions to promote and develop further the sustainable fishing methods of the Plymouth fishing fleet as set out in Article 28.
3. To help Plymouth realise the true potential of its Fishing and related industries by unlocking the potential for growth, training and jobs within the sector through the promotion of human capital and social dialogue as set out in Article 29.

- (iii) Proposals for GP services in Plymouth
Councillor Mrs Bowyer proposed and Councillor Downie seconded the motion on the Proposals for GP services in Plymouth.

Councillor Stevens proposed and Councillor P Davey seconded an amendment, which was circulated to Members, as follows:

'Third bullet point add "and Hyde Park and St Barnabas surgeries"

Fifth bullet point – after 'Centre' insert "and at Hyde Park and St Barnabas"

Seventh bullet point – add at end "and relevant facilities at Hyde Park and St Barnabas".

Following a request from ten councillors for a recorded vote on the amendment, the vote was taken and the amendment was lost.

For the proposal (23)

(Councillors Aspinall, Bowie, Coker, Dann, P Davey, S Davey, Evans, Hendy, Mavin, McDonald, Morris, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Rennie, Singh, Sparling, Stevens, Jon Taylor, Kate Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler and Winter).

Against the proposal (27)

(Councillor Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Mrs Bridgeman, Carson, Churchill, Cook, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Fletcher, Foster, Mrs Foster, Jordan, Kelly, Martin Leaves, Mike Leaves, Sam Leaves, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Ricketts, Riley, Storer and Wiggins).

Abstention (1)

(Lord Mayor)

Absent (6)

(Councillors Fry, James, Loveridge, Lowry, Penberthy and Smith)

Following a vote on the original motion, Council agreed:

Recent developments in some of Plymouth's general practices have necessitated new plans to ensure continued provision of primary care to Plymouth residents. Specifically, these developments include:

- GP in Hyde Park surgery giving notice to NHS England on their contract
- GP in St Barnabas surgery giving notice to NHS England on their contract
- Approaching end of interim contract period for Ernesettle Practice (comprised of Ernesettle, Mount Gould, Trelawny and Cumberland surgeries)
- Continued lack of local primary care provision in Barne Barton

In response to these developments, NHS England has commenced a process of

engagement with patients and other stakeholders on an initial set of ideas for the continued provision of GP services for patients. It is the intention of NHS England to proceed to formal procurement based on a final set of proposals which will be informed by feedback from the engagement process. Notable amongst these ideas include the following:

- That final procurement in October 2016 goes ahead to attract a best provider from April 2017 for surgeries in Barne Barton, Ernesettle, Mount Gould and Trelawny.
- That the procurement does not include Cumberland surgery, Hyde Park Surgery and St Barnabas surgery.

Bearing in mind that Barne Barton neighbourhood have never had local primary care provision, this element of the proposal by NHS England is very welcome.

The termination of provision of primary care at Hyde Park Surgery and St Barnabas surgery is unfortunate but it must be ensured that the registered patients at those practices continue to access good quality primary care at other practices with the least disruption possible.

The key concern with the proposals however is the potential for closure of the Cumberland Surgery. It is notable while this surgery has never been formally contracted for (having been originally set up by LiveWell South West when it provided Ernesettle practice and latterly provided on an interim basis by Access Healthcare), it is a growing, thriving practice serving some of the most deprived populations of Plymouth. The loss of this practice will not only create avoidable instability for some of our most deprived populations in Devonport but will put at risk most valued primary care services delivering value for patients and benefits to the wider system.

We recognise the direction of travel of national primary care policy – GP at scale, federations, sustainable workforce, integration and more care in the community. However, it is unclear as to how any proposed closure of the Cumberland practice delivers these aspirations.

To this end, we call upon this Council to:

- Take note of the proposed changes on which NHS England is now engaging patients and partners
- Welcome NHS England's proposals for local primary care provision in Barne Barton
- Seek urgent clarification from NHS England as to the rationale for the proposals concerning the Cumberland surgery
- Seek urgent assurance from NHS England about its commitment to

meaningful engagement around these proposals as well as to ensuring feedback actually does inform formulation of final options for procurement

- Make clear a strong wish to see diversity and quality offer of choice of primary care provision continue in the Cumberland Centre in a relevant shape or form
- Specifically require that, in accordance with recent conversations with NHS England, the Cumberland surgery is re-located with the Devonport Health Centre but remaining as a separate practice
- That all key partners in our system – Plymouth City Council, NEW Devon CCG, Plymouth University, Plymouth Hospitals NHS Trust and LiveWell South West urgently work with both Devonport GP surgeries to accelerate progress on the aspiration of creating a health and wellbeing hub based at the Cumberland ‘campus’, with arrangements for eventual amalgamation or some form of federation between those practices defined as soon as possible.

(iv) NHS England proposals

Councillor Stevens proposed and Councillor P Davey seconded the motion on NHS England Proposals, as follows:

Plymouth City Council expresses its deep concern over NHS England proposals which could result in the closure of the Cumberland Centre, Hyde Park and St Barnabas GP Surgeries following yet more cuts to the National Health Service. We recognise the popularity of these vital community services among patients and oppose any measures which would force people to travel long distances to access their GP.

We welcome NHS England's assurance that no final decisions have been taken and encourage all those affected to actively engage with the consultation process, ensuring all opinions are heard. We also recognise the need to proactively plan GP provision in Plymouth as populations change and move.

We pledge to do all we can to work alongside local people in attempting to persuade NHS England not to implement these potentially harmful measures and to maintain GP provision on these sites. In the meantime we also call upon Plymouth's Members of Parliament to refrain from supporting further NHS cuts.

Following a vote, the motion was lost.

(v) Stonehouse Barracks

Motion on Notice 10e, about Stonehouse Barracks, was withdrawn and Councillor Bowyer proposed a revised motion which was seconded by Councillor Evans. This was circulated to Members, as follows:

‘Following the Government’s announcement to sell Royal Marines Stonehouse, this Council resolves:

1. To write to the Prime Minister seeking assurances that the Royal Marines will continue to be located in Plymouth, including the Headquarters of 3 Commando Brigade Royal Marines (currently based at RM Stonehouse).
2. To write to the Secretary of State for Defence, asking for the full rationale behind the decision to close RM Stonehouse, seeking assurances that there is sufficient alternative capacity for the Royal Marines in Plymouth and requesting that the MOD now consults and engages with the City's Public Sector Land Board.'

Following a vote, the motion was carried.

(vi) Stonehouse Barracks

Councillor Evans withdrew this motion, as referred to in minute 37e.

(vii) Organ donation awareness and moving to an 'opt out' system

Councillor J Taylor proposed and Councillor Stevens seconded the motion on organ donation awareness and moving to an 'opt out' system.

(Councillor Darcy proposed and Councillor Rennie seconded a motion to suspend standing orders to allow the meeting to continue after 7.30 pm. Following a vote, this was agreed.)

Following a vote, the motion was carried and Council agreed:

This Council notes the shortage of kidney and other donor organs that exists in the United Kingdom and the suffering of those awaiting an organ transplant in Plymouth.

Council notes that:

- (1) although 90% of people say they support organ donation, for lots of reasons only a quarter of the UK population is on the organ donor register;
- (2) 3 people die every day across the UK while waiting for an organ transplant; and
- (3) support for a change to a soft opt out system is backed by major charities, including the British Heart Foundation, Kidney Research UK, Diabetes UK, the Cystic Fibrosis Trust and the British Medical Association.

This Council believes that the current system of signing up to be on the donor register, whilst well intentioned, is not leading to the significant increase of organ donors that is needed to meet the needs of people on waiting lists in Plymouth. This Council therefore believes it would be preferable to further explore moving to a system of opting out of organ donation, subject to suitable

safeguards.

Council agrees to:

- (a) write to the Secretary of State for Health asking him to produce detailed proposals on the lines suggested above
- (b) send a copy of this motion to Plymouth MPs with a covering letter seeking their public support for the campaign
- (c) encourage residents, Councillors and employees to join the current donor register;
- (d) publicise our support for the campaign for moving to a 'soft opt out system' through Council media channels.

- (viii) Sprinklers in schools
Councillor McDonald proposed and Councillor Evans seconded a motion about sprinklers in schools.

Councillor Mrs Beer proposed and Councillor Bowyer seconded an amendment, which was circulated to Members, as follows:

'Council condemns the Department of Education's decision to drop the requirement for sprinklers to be compulsory in new build schools and nurseries in Plymouth.

Therefore, this Council resolves to write to the Chief Fire Officer to seek his views, in order to consider whether this Council should lobby the Secretary of State to restore the stipulated requirement for all new builds to have sprinklers.'

Following a vote, the amendment was carried.

(Councillor Cook declared a Disclosable Pecuniary Interest and left the meeting for this item).

- (ix) Fortnightly brown bin collection
Councillor Stevens proposed and Councillor Singh seconded the motion on fortnightly brown bin collections, as follows:

Council believes that the local community is not persuaded of the case for a move to fortnightly brown bin collections.

Consequently, Council resolves to instruct the Cabinet to drop these proposals forthwith.

Following a request from ten Councillors for a recorded vote on the motion, the vote was lost.

For the motion (21)

(Councillors Aspinall, Bowie, Coker, Dann, P Davey, S Davey, Evans, Hendy, McDonald, Morris, Parker-Delaz-Ajete, Rennie, Singh, Sparling, Stevens, Jon Taylor, Tuffin, Tuohy, Vincent, Wheeler and Winter).

Against the motion (27)

(Councillors Ball, Mrs Beer, Bowyer, Mrs Bowyer, Mrs Bridgeman, Carson, Churchill, Cook, Darcy, Deacon, Downie, Drean, Fletcher, Foster, Mrs Foster, Jordan, Kelly, Martin Leaves, Mike Leaves, Sam Leaves, Dr Mahony, Nicholson, Mrs Pengelly, Ricketts, Riley, Storer and Wiggins).

Absent (8)

(Councillors Fry, James, Loveridge, Lowry, Mavin, Penberthy, Smith and Kate Taylor).

Abstention (1)

(Lord Mayor)

38. **Dates of full Council meetings 2017/2018**

Councillor Riley proposed and Councillor Bowyer seconded the proposed dates for Full Council 2017/18:

- 3 July 2017
- 25 September 2017
- 20 November 2017
- 29 January 2018
- 26 February 2018 (Budget and Council Tax)
- 26 March 2018
- 18 May 2018 (AGM)

Following a vote, Council agreed these dates.

39. **Questions by councillors**

	From	To	Subject
1	Councillor P Davey	Councillor Bowyer	Full-size hockey pitches
2	Councillor McDonald	Councillor Mike Leaves	Collection of discarded needles and syringes from public parks
3	Councillor Tuohy	Councillor Mike Leaves	Overgrown weeds and falling leaves within Ham Ward
4	Councillor Bowie	Councillor Mrs Beer	The closure of Early Birds Nursery (Written response to be provided)
5	Councillor Mrs Bridgeman	Councillor Downie	The number of volunteers in the city

6	Councillor Coker	Councillor Darcy	Collection of outstanding Council Tax (Written response to be provided)
7	Councillor Stevens	Councillor Riley	Transparency of Governance Review (Written response to be provided)
8	Councillor Jon Taylor	Councillor Jordan	Library Project
9	Councillor Coker	Councillor Ricketts	Confirmation that controlled parking zones were still in place (Written response to be provided)
10	Councillor McDonald	Councillor Mrs Beer	Administering medication to children
11	Councillor Coker	Councillor Ricketts	Faulty traffic light on Mutley Plain
12	Councillor Evans	Councillor Darcy	Capital Programme
13	Councillor McDonald	Councillor Mrs Beer	Guardianship (Written response to be provided)
14	Councillor Coker	Councillor Ricketts	Policy on permanent repairs (Written response to be provided)

Please note that questions, answers, supplementary questions and supplementary answers have been summarised.